# Ultra<sup>HD</sup> FORUM

MasterClass



### Masterclass agenda

### 1. Where are we with UHD?

- State of the industry
  - Operator Survey Results
  - Interoperability today

### 2. Where UHD is heading?

- Smarter pixels
- High Frame Rate
- Examples from the field
- 3. Zoom on next generation audio





### Global Advocacy for Next-Gen A/V Delivery



## **Operators / Members Live Deployment**



Date	Operator	HDR	Audio	Status
May'16	Sincerty.	SDR	5.1	Commercial service
June'16	<b>NeuLion</b>	SDR	5.1	Commercial service
June'16	🂩 kpn	SDR	5.1	Friendly
Aug'16	comcast,	SDR / HDR10	5.1 / Atmos	Commercial service
Aug'16	sky	SDR	5.1/ Atmos	Commercial service
Rio'16	*	SDR / HDR10	5.1 / Atmos	Commercial service
Oct'16	SKY PerfecTV!	HLG	5.1	Commercial service
April'17	Sirect V.	HLG	5.1	Trial/Demo
May'17	are subject to	HLG	5.1	Commercial service



## Ultra HD Forum Progress



#### 51

V1.4 (incl best practices)

DTG/DTV Platform plug fest (June'17)

Phase B planning

Master Class on UHD @ IBC'17



## What is coming Next?



5 Demos on EBU booth

Phase B survey result

UBB Forum (Huawei Oct'17)

Meeting in Korea (Winter Olympic'18)

UHD Alliance on Broadcast SMPTE (SDI HDR signaling/ST 2094)

## Phase B



Торіс	Details
NGA	Object based
New HDRs	Dolby, Technicolor, HDR10+, ST 2094, China ,
HDR Dual Layer Technology	Backward compatibility
HFR	P100 & 120
HDR Conversion Tools	HDR10 <> HLG
HDR "Brightness" Control	Could become a regulated topic
Applications : OTT	Live & VoD
Applications : OTA	ATSC 3.0 / DVB-T2 / ISDB-T
Applications : MVPD	Broadcast / IP Unicast & Multicast



## Masterclass agenda

### 1. Where are we with UHD?

- State of the industry
- Operator Survey Results
  - Interoperability today

### 2. Where UHD is heading?

- Smarter pixels
- High Frame Rate
- Examples from the field
- 3. Zoom on next generation audio







## Introduction: Service Provider Survey

- A Service Provider Survey was conducted to help guide Phase B efforts and other UHDF activity
- Only service providers were requested to participate (Cable, IPTV, OTA broadcaster, DBS, OTT, etc.)
- Many thanks to ATSC, NAB, DTG, Forum Audiovisuelle Numérique, and other organizations for helping promote the survey
- 80+ respondents
- "Consider the next 2-5 years" was the context for the questions



## Introduction: Ultra HD Forum Guidelines

- The Ultra HD Forum Guidelines explain the complex UHD landscape
- Phase A Guidelines describe processes providing linear UHD services by 2016
  - Phase A Guidelines v1.4 released at IBC 2017
- Phase B Guidelines cover new UHD technologies which were not commercially available in 2016, but have become available since then and have significant momentum within the industry
  - The Service Operator Survey was conducted in part to guide development of this document





### Phase B Technology Inclusion Criteria

- the technology must be proven to be functional in an end-toend workflow that is within scope of the Guidelines document (or that portion of the workflow that pertains to the technology), either via early deployment or via interop testing to members' satisfaction -AND-
- at least 2 service providers (or 1 major provider) demonstrate interest in the technology; service providers do not need to be members of the UHDF, and their support may be demonstrated, for example, by written confirmation to the UHDF working group, or by verifiable products in production that support the technology, etc.



## **Phase B Technologies**

The following technologies have met the Phase B inclusion criteria:

- Technicolor SL-HDR1
- Dolby Vision
- High Frame Rate (120/100 fps), for HD resolution content
- Next Gen Audio
  - AC-4
  - MPEG-H
- Scalable HEVC (SHVC)



More technologies may be added as the work progresses

### **Survey Topics**



#### Survey topics included:

- UHD in general, including spatial resolution, color space and dynamic range
- HDR, including transfer function (PQ/HLG) and metadata
- Phase B technologies
- Video codecs
- Information about the respondent's operation
- This presentation covers some of the results related to Phase B technologies



### About the survey respondents: How do you categorize your operation?

	ANSWER CHOICES	RESPONSES
VD - DRS(PTH	MVPD - IPTV	35.71%
	MVPD - DBS/DTH	33,33%
MVPD (MSO - Cattle	MVPD / MSO - Cable	14.29%
Terenitrial	Terrestrial broadcaster (DTT/OTA)	59.52%
broadcakter	Online streaming service (OTT)	54.76%
Online	Other (please specify)	14.29%
	Total Respondents: 42	
Other (piece specify)		
0% 10% 20% 30% 40	50% 60% 70% 80% 10% 100%	



### About the survey respondents In which region(s) do you operate?

20% 100%





ANSWER CHOICES	RESPONSES
North America	52.38%
South or Central America	16.67%
Europe	66.67%
Asia	19.05%
Prefer not to say	0.00%
Other (please specify)	2.38%
Total Respondents: 42	





## Survey results for SL-HDR1 (1 of 2)

- 50% of respondents were familiar with SL-HDR1
  - Those not familiar skipped the SL-HDR1 questions
- 76% found the main customer benefit to be "Maintaining competent color across SDR & HDR presentations"
- 100% of cable operators (and others as well) considered a competent SDR picture on non-HDR devices to be a benefit of SL-HDR1
- Business benefits included distribution of HDR content as SDR as beneficial (71%)
  - Business benefits also included production in their preferred HDR format (e.g., HLG, HDR10, SLog3) (81%)



## Survey results for SL-HDR1 (2 of 2)

- 81% saw benefit in not requiring static or dynamic metadata carried in production
- Survey comment: "Automatic conversion of HDR to SDR for Live production may impact the quality of the SDR production"
  - Technicolor notes that evidence suggests the SDR is improved for live.
- Respondent comment: "Conversion box is required for HDR devices already sold"
  - Technicolor notes that some consumer displays support SL-HDR1 directly. Over 25 system-on-chip for displays, STBs, and dongles are currently available from 10 vendors. Regardless: There are no black screens.



## Survey results for Dolby Vision

- 85% of respondents were familiar with Dolby Vision
  - Those not familiar skipped the Dolby Vision questions
- "High-Quality Images" are Very Beneficial to more than half (51%) of the respondents, an additional 27% found high-Quality Images to be Somewhat Beneficial – less than 10% found this to be of No or Low benefit.
- Consistent/Predictable HDR reproduction found to be Very Beneficial to more than half the respondents (54%) with another 34% finding it Somewhat beneficial – only 5% found this feature of no or low benefit.

Respondents found Dolby Vision more valuable for Pre-recorded content (71%) than for Live Content (44%).



#### Survey results for HFR: What frame rate(s) do you see as valuable?



87% said 50/60fps is "very valuable" and no one said it is "not very valuable"

42% said 100/120fps is "very valuable" and 27% said "somewhat valuable"

People are not looking beyond 120fps in the next 2-5 years

Note: The horizontal axis indicates a weighted score for answers formatted as "very", "somewhat", and "not very"

### Survey results for HFR: What spatial resolution(s) are valuable with 100/120fps?



1080p is the top spatial resolution choice for HFR

2160p is a close second

Very little interest in 720p or 1440p





## Additional survey results for HFR

#### Comments included:

- "Infrastructure and production costs/challenges are a barrier"
- "Concern that not enough content would benefit from HFR"
- Less than 15% have experimented with HFR
- Over 93% think backward compatibility is "somewhat" or "very important"
  - These numbers are higher than for HDR and NGA backward compatibility
  - Only 7% think backward compatibility is not important or aren't sure
- The top-rated consumer benefit of HFR is for improved action scenes and sports
  - One respondent said maybe not Cricket, though!





## Survey results for Next Gen Audio

- The benefits of NGA were fairly evenly favored with enhanced dialog and immersive audio scoring slightly higher than other benefits Lots of uncertainty regarding NGA
  - 20-30% uncertain on channel-based height info, dynamic audio objects and HOA
  - 30% uncertain about which system(s) they would consider
  - 30% uncertain about how to address backward compatibility
- Concerns included:
  - Challenging to implement for service providers and producers
  - Challenging to implement for consumers
  - Demand is unproven; consumers haven't even adopted 5.1 on a mass level
- Comment: "education is needed on NGA"



## Survey Results for SHVC

- 43% of respondents were familiar with SHVC
- Valued uses included:
  - Distributing a lower resolution base layer for mobile (71%)
  - Distributing both base and enhancement layers over the same channel (82%)
  - Distributing base and enhancement layers over distinct channels (59%)
  - 65% saw value in using the enhancement layer for premium services



## What do you see as barriers to launching UHD services? (1 of 2)

- 1. Cost of infrastructure
- 2. Availability of UHD content
- 3. Availability of standards
- 4. Diversity of consumer devices
- 5. Consumer education
- 6. Content security
- 7. Market penetration of consumer devices
- 8. Ease/difficulty of consumer set-up



Note: The horizontal axis indicates a weighted score for answers formatted as "very", "somewhat", and "not very"



What do you see as barriers to launching UHD services? (2 of 2)

People also provided other entries for barriers:

- market demand in OTA
- cost of delivery in OTT
- availability of IP-based infrastructure
- lack of single HDR solution (x2)
- MVPD customers and advertisers not willing pay more for UHD
- quality of UHD content (sometimes not much better than HD)





Q: What standards, guidelines or recommended practices are Still needed for UHD services? (1 of 2)

- Guidelines for production
  - Guidelines on how to produce HDR
  - Need for "sub toolkits", i.e., instruction on how to best produce based on content type (x3)
  - Recommended Practices for simultaneous UHD/HDR and HD/SDR production (x2)
- Service preparation
  - Recommended practices for SDR<>HDR and 2020<>709 conversion





What standards, guidelines or recommended practices are Still needed for UHD services? (2 of 2)

### Signaling and Transport

- Standards for signaling HDR (in IP and SDI) (x4)
- An alternative for MPEG HEVC is needed by 2020
- ATSC 3.0 completion (x4)
- Decoding and Rendering
  - HDR standards on all TV inputs (IP, HDMI, USB, etc.) (x4)
  - Robust and reliable control and switching of HDR modes in consumer TVs (x2)





### Next Steps

- Publish survey results after fully analyzing data
- Repeat the survey regularly to see trends
- Work with Standards Development Organizations to fill gaps in standards
- Identify and document UHD "sub-toolkits" for different content and service types
- Conduct Inter-Ops to test "sub-toolkit" workflows
- Continue developing UHD end-to-end Guidelines to help operators make wise choices for their businesses





### Masterclass agenda

### 1. Where are we with UHD?

- State of the industry
- Operator Survey Results
- Interoperability today

### 2. Where UHD is heading?

- Smarter pixels
- High Frame Rate
- Examples from the field
- 3. Zoom on next generation audio

Ian Nock



## Interoperability Today

What Ultra HD Forum Plugfests are Telling US About the Future of UHD





## Metadata Support MaxFALL MaxCLL Mastering Colour Display Volume



## **UI** Complexity & Vocabulary



Target Inputs	Commen
Padala Marillana an	Conta
Colour Temperature	Water 2
Starpetin	
Balas Radutter	01
HITED Name Reduction	10H
Ministra	











### Masterclass agenda

### 1. Where are we with UHD?

- State of the industry
- Operator Survey Results
- Interoperability today

### 2. Where UHD is heading?

- Smarter pixels
  - High Frame Rate
  - Examples from the field
- 3. Zoom on next generation audio

Pat Griffis Stephan Heimbecher





## HDR of Tomorrow – Better, Smarter Pixels

Patrick Griffis Vice President, UHD Forum VP Technology Office of the CTO Dolby Labs



### **Goals For This Presentation**

- Understand the new language of "color volume" and a key challenge of the HDR age to map content from one color volume to another to preserve creative intent (whether episodic or live).
- Understand that new technology makes possible the analysis and delivery of content attributes on a scene by scene basis making pixels "smarter" to facilitate this process.
- Understand that SMPTE has completed a suite of standards ST-2094 which defines mechanisms for delivering the content information with frame level precision.
  - Understand that services and products deploying these techniques are already in market for OTT, Blu-ray, and soon broadcast with more to come.
### An HDR Display







#### Display Color Volume

The 3D palette of all colors that can be reproduced at all allowable intensities





Image Color Volume The pixels that comprise the HDR image change location on a frame by frame basis

#### An HDR Image





# HDR: Opening the Lid to "Pandora's Pixel" Box HDR Color Volume

SDR Color

Volume

### **Putting** "Pandora's Pixels" Back in the Box!

- Each target display has a different color volume Use Color Volume Mapping to correctly place pixels into the target display color volume preserving relationships
  - Both Tone Mapping (intensity) and Gamut Mapping (color)





Typical UHDA HDR Display e.g. OLED/LCD

Legacy SDR 709 Display

Future HDR Display

### Putting the Pixels in the Box: Static <u>Container</u> Mapping of HDR to SDR



Static Color Volume Mapping: Container to Container

HDR Mastering Display Color Volume (ST 2086) SDR Display Color Volume (BT.709)



Region of the image to prioritize





#### A Better Way Map the Content based on real time image content analysis



Content courtesy of the EBU



Max: 2775

Mean: 238.7 cd/m\*

Min: 0:041.cd/m





#### A Better Way Map the Content based on real time image content analysis



Mean: 1820,8 cd/m

Min: 0:041 cd/m<sup>2</sup>

Region of the image to prioritize



### Delivering Real-time Content Characteristics: ST 2094 "Dynamic Metadata for Color Volume Transform"

- SMPTE ST 2094 is a suite of dynamic metadata standards for color volume transforms
- ST 2094-10:2016 Standard provides:
  - A parametrically-defined color volume mapping computed from the input content i.e. it is a "descriptive" system rather than a "prescriptive" system
  - The most important elements for **live** production are:
    - deep shadow => Min
    - mid-tone (facial and interior) => Mid
    - highlight regions => Max
  - Computed on a frame by frame basis, but adaptively smoothed to provide temporal consistency during rapid image brightness changes
- ST 2094-10 is now in Candidate Standard ballot for ATSC 3.0

### **"Smarter Pixels" = Better, More Consistent Pictures**

- Tracking <u>content</u> characteristics in real time makes pixels smarter to improve reproduction quality and consistency across a growing variety of consumer displays from media room to mobile
- Dynamic Metadata provides the mechanism to do this
  - Optimizes <u>content</u> mapping of HDR to SDR (or intermediate brightness levels)
  - Preserves more contrast in dark and bright images
  - Minimizes mapping when the image is already in the target range, thus maintaining the original image contrast
- ST 2094-10 dynamic metadata standard enables mapping from any arbitrary production color volume to any arbitrary consumer device color volume providing future-proof scalability
- Dolby's implementation of ST 2094-10 is widely deployed today via OTT in episodic, starting for Blu-ray and Mobile, and soon for live content

### Over 100 "Smarter Pixels" Titles in the Market Today

U





### "Smarter Pixels"- Work in LIVE!

- For HDR Broadcast plant
  - A unified PQ HDR workflow is interoperable with legacy SDR and compatible with other approaches and provides the highest quality open standard method to capture and process HDR. PQ is already the preferred choice of Hollywood and OTT.
  - Supports legacy 10 bit baseband broadcast infrastructure 3G SDI
- METADATA -
- **No** metadata traverses the plant infrastructure– derived at the final encoding stage just before emission/transmission
- Transmission with standard HEVC main10 codec single layer PQ encoding with SMPTE ST-2094-10 metadata carried in an SEI message

### "Smarter Pixels" HDR Broadcast Plant Overview



### Over 100 "Smarter Pixels" Titles in the Market Today



















# Thank You!

























# Masterclass agenda

### 1. Where are we with UHD?

- State of the industry
- Operator Survey Results
- Interoperability today

## 2. Where UHD is heading?

- Smarter pixels
- High Frame Rate
- Examples from the field
- 3. Zoom on next generation audio

Madeleine Noland



# Introduction: Ultra HD Forum Guidelines

- The Ultra HD Forum produces Guidelines to help the industry navigate the complex UHD landscape
- Phase B Guidelines will focus on new UHD technologies which were not commercially available in 2016, but have become available since then, or have significant momentum within the industry
  - The Service Operator Survey was conducted in part to guide development of this document



# Phase B Technology Inclusion Criteria

- 1. the technology must be proven to be functional in an end-to-end workflow that is within scope of the Guidelines document (or that portion of the workflow that pertains to the technology), either via early deployment or via interop testing to members' satisfaction AND
- at least 2 service providers (or 1 major provider) demonstrate interest in the technology; service providers do not need to be members of the UHDF, and their support may be demonstrated, for example, by written confirmation to the UHDF working group, or by verifiable products in production that support the technology, etc.



# Phase B Technologies

- The following technologies have met the Phase B inclusion criteria:
- Technicolor SL-HDR1
- Dolby Vision
- High Frame Rate (120/100 fps), for HD resolution content
- Next Gen Audio
  - AC-4
  - MPEG-H
- Scalable HEVC (SHVC)
- More technologies may be added as the work progresses



# HFR in DVB and ATSC

- Both DVB UHD-1 Phase 2 (ETSI TS 101 154 v. 2.3.1) and ATSC 3.0 (A/341) include framerates up to 120 fps
- Both include optional temporal sublayering for backward compatibility
- ATSC A/341 includes optional temporal filtering for enhancing the standard framerate picture when temporal sublayering is used

### **Temporal Sub-layering**

#### DVB-UHD phase 2: HFR backwards compatible solution

Use of HEVC temporal sub-layers with signalling based on temporalId







# **Temporal Sub-layering**

- In the case that an HFR video stream is available, an SFR stream may be extracted by dropping every other picture
- HEVC temporal sub-layering identifies every other picture which enables division of the stream prior to decompression
  - The SFR frames are Temporal ID = 0
  - The additional frames needed for HFR are Temporal ID = 1
- SFR devices render the frames with ID = 0
- HFR devices render all frames, i.e., ID = 0 and ID = 1
- In DVB, dual PIDs are used to carry the two sub-layers
- ATSC 3.0, one video stream includes the two temporal video sub-steams (for ROUTE/DASH protocol implementations)



# Temporal Filtering in ATSC 3.0

- According to A/341, achieving backward compatibility by rendering every other frame may cause unwanted strobing, depending on the camera angle used to capture the HFR image
- Temporal filtering is designed to improve the image quality on SFR devices
  - The SFR device plays the filtered SFR frames (filtered frames are optimized for SFR)
    - The HFR device recovers the original, pre-filtered SFR frames and renders all frames (pre-filtered frames are optimized for HFR)





# **Temporal Filtering**

Original 120 fps stream

Temporal Sub-layer stream with Temporal Filtering SFR device renders ID=0

Original 120 fps stream HFR device inverse-filters and renders all frames



Adapted from "A/341:2017, "VIDEO—HEVC" https://www.atsc.org/atsc-30-standard/a3412017-video-hevc/



# HFR on display at IBC

- SES/Astra booth (Hall 1, B51)
  - 2160p100, SDR, BT.709
- Ateme booth (Hall 1, D71)
  1080p100, HDR, BT.2020
- DVB booth (Hall 1, D81)
  - 1080p100, HDR, BT.2020
- EBU booth Ultra HD Forum demo (Hall, 10 F20)
  - 1080p100, HDR, BT.2020

# 4EVER-2 First Live HFR end to end demo

Real scene, Aren'Ice (Paris)



6 HFR 1080p100 Cameras, mikes



Production

Mixing and encoding HFR and NGA

Transmission



Reception

Satellite broadcasting Consumer electronic display

IE VER









# Ultra HD Forum Phase B Guidelines

- The Ultra HD Forum's goal is to promote adoption of UHD industry-wide
- The Guidelines are intended to "demystify" UHD technologies so that operators can understand the possibilities and make wise choices
- Phase A Guidelines are available on the UHDF website; v1.4 was just released
- Phase B Guidelines will build on that work



# Masterclass agenda

### 1. Where are we with UHD?

- State of the industry
- Operator Survey Results
- Interoperability today

## 2. Where UHD is heading?

- Smarter pixels
- High Frame Rate
- Examples from the field



3. Zoom on next generation audio



## Ultra HD Forum -Masterclass Stories from the bleeding edge: World's First UHD + HDR + NGA live broadcast Simon Gauntlett Director of Imaging Standards and Technology, **Dolby Laboratories**



#### **Summer of HDR Trials**

- BT Sport launched Premier League Football in UHD with NGA on 31<sup>st</sup> Jan 2017
- Summer 2017 included several trials of HDR
- Culminated in UEFA Champions League Final
  - Over 25 HDR cameras
  - Slog3 live production
  - PQ10 contribution feed with Dolby Atmos
  - Live screening in the Dolby Soho Cinema
  - HDR presentation with live insertion of SDR adverts converted to PQ
  - Atmos to 2.0 transitions at advert break







#### Generic HDR Broadcast Plant Overview

LIVE BT.2100 PQ WORKFLOW

LIVE TRANSMISSION w/2094-10





#### **Generic HDR Broadcast Plant Overview**

LIVE BT.2100 PQ WORKFLOW

LIVE TRANSMISSION w/2094-10





#### **Summer of HDR Trials**

- Waveform shows a wipe between Slog3 HDR camera and SDR camera converted to Slog3
- Then the whole Slog3 output converted to PQ
- Clearly see the pitch is aligned in both waveforms





#### French Open 2017

- 4 Sony HDC 4300 cameras
- Slog3 live converted to PQ and SDR
- GrassValley Mixer
- SAM Kahuna conversion of HD SDR graphics to PQ
- Monitoring on Sony BVMX300
- Cameras racked in SDR with gain applied to HDR



зш

EUROMEDIA



#### French Open 2017

- HDR encoded by Ateme Titan Live with HPU
- Immersive audio mix using Dolby Atmos
- World first broadcast of Dolby Vision + AC-4
- Fransat (Eutelsat)
  - SDR 17.5 Mbps, E-AC-3 448 kbps
  - HDR 30 Mbps, E-AC-3 448 kbps, AC-4 256 kbps
- TDF (DVB-T2)
  - SDR 17.5 Mbps, E-AC-3 448 kbps
  - HDR 22.5 Mbps, E-AC-3 448 kbps, AC-4 246 kbps





-



Franse


#### RTVE –

#### Solemn Changing of the Royal Guard

- 4 Grassvalley cameras 4000 Nits PQ
- Ateme Titan encoder HEVC, E-AC-3 and HPU for dynamic metadata
- Contribution feed via Hispasat from Madrid to Barcelona and Seville
- DVB-T2 broadcast
  - 2160p50, 25Mbps HEVC with Dolby Vision
  - 128 kbps E-AC3
  - 48 kbps AC4
- 2 LG OLEDs and 2 Loewe OLED
  - HDR10 over RF inputs
  - Dolby Vision via HDMI from HiSilicon STB







# D

#### Conclusions

- Summer 2017 saw shift from isolated camera trials to full multi-camera live productions in HDR
- Still learning how to get the best experience for both SDR and HDR viewers
- Proven PQ native and Slog3 workflows
- Proven realtime generation of dynamic metadata at point of transmission





#### Masterclass agenda

#### 1. Where are we with UHD?

- State of the industry
- Operator Survey Results
- Interoperability today

#### 2. Where UHD is heading?

- Smarter pixels
- High Frame Rate
- Examples from the field

3. Zoom on next generation audio



### NGA session

- Chair: Skipp Pizzi (NAB)
- UX expert: Ludovic Noblet (B-COM)
- Panelist: Rob France (Dolby)
- Panelist: Stefan Melzer (Fraunhofer)
- Fadi Malak (DTS)

#### Experience



- We have entered a « beyond digital » era
- All about delivering experiences
- Audio: intelligibility, immersion, personalization, accessibility ... and beyond

Services: TV, multi-screen ... and beyond



#### One key word

# Engagement



# Engagement

- Katz, Blumler, and Gurevitch (1974)
  - Uses and Gratification



- Development stages back in the 1940`s...
- What people do with media, NOT what media do with people
- Audience centered approach, assumes people have needs that can be satisfied by media (gratification)
- Information, identity, social interaction, escapism
- Pine & Gilmore (1998)
  - Experience Economy and the 4 realms of an experience
  - Immersion/absorption, passive/active participation
  - Work significantly expanded in 2001, 2009, 2015 & 2016



# Back to NGA

D

- NGA not just about use cases
  - Storytelling/narration, intelligibility, immersion, personalization, accessibility
  - Think about how NGA can increase engagement
  - Leverage investment into contents
- A fundamental technology asset for the development of new media
  - Multi-screen and beyond (VR/deep media, AR/ambiant media)
  - Avoid bottom-levelling
  - Prepare investment into the future

### The 4 realms of an experience



#### The Four Realms of an Experience

Adapted from \*Pipe and Gimore (1998); expanded with 28 since, Schmitt, and Zarantemitt (2002), \*Machinek, Mathematic, and Rigdon (2003), and \*Vesquez and Cheng (2015) | Combined by Sebastiano Mereu (2016)



\*CROI: Consumer Return On Investment



#### NGA Panel



- Panelist: Rob France (Dolby)
- Panelist: Stefan Melzer (Fraunhofer)
- Fadi Malak (DTS)

